

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF STATE LEVEL EXPERT APPRAISAL
COMMITTEE, ORISSA HELD ON 26th MAY 2010**

The meeting of State Level Expert Appraisal Committee, Orissa was held on 26th May 2010 in the Meeting Hall of Orissa State Pollution Control Board, Bhubaneswar at 11.00 AM. Dr. Gagan Bihari Nityananda Chainy, Chairman, SEAC Orissa chaired the meeting. The following members were present in the meeting.

1.	Prof. Gagan Bihari Nityananda Chainy	-	Chairman
2.	Prof. Swoyam Prakash Rout	-	Member
3.	Dr. Harekrishna Nayak,	-	Member
4.	Dr. Moheshwar Patra	-	Member
5.	Prof. R. C. Mohanty	-	Member
6.	Prof. Kumar Das,	-	Member
7.	Dr. Surendra Nath Das	-	Member
8.	Sr. S. S. Pattnaik, IFS	-	Member

A total of 4 project proponents were invited for final appraisal followed by discussion. The agenda-wise proceedings and deliberations of the meeting of the committee are detailed below :

ITEM NO . 1

MANITIRUMALA APARTMENTS RESIDENTIAL COMPLEX PROMOTED BY ALL ORISSA STATE BANK OFFICERS HOUSING COOPERATIVE SOCIETY LTD., BHUBANESWAR. AT PLOT NO.21, MOUZA: KALARAHANGA, NANDANA KANANA ROAD, BHUBANESWAR, ORISSA

The proposal is a residential complex promoted by All Orissa State Bank Officers Housing Cooperative Society Ltd., Bhubaneswar. At Plot No.21, Mouza: Kalarahanga, Nandana Kanana Road, Bhubaneswar, Orissa. There will be 11 blocks of G+14 storied buildings; a total of 603 flats in which 3,317 persons are likely to reside. It has provision for a Club House in which 302 persons can be accommodated at a time.. Total Plot Area is 41075.2 Sq,M . Total built up area is 76050.80 sq.m. The total makeup water requirement is 307.5 KLD. The water requirement will be met from municipal supplies. Around 428.165 KLD of waste water will be generated which will be treated in a Sewage Treatment Plant (STP). Treated water will be re-used for dual flushing, green belt and landscaping and 168.9 KLD will be discharged to municipal sewer. Total solid waste generation will be 1.5 TPD. The power requirement is 3938 KVA. Total cost of the project is Rs.70 crores. The building is completely residential in nature. Bhubaneswar Development Authority has not yet approved the building plan. The Consultant Sri. Manoranjan Nayak, Global Experts C-23, BJB Nagar, Bhubaneswar – 751 014 made the presentation. The observations of the committee is as follows

1. The Proponent has not submitted approved BDA plan and intimated that the plan is likely to be approved shortly. The proponent has to submit BDA approved building plan.
2. The proposed plots are in low-lying and, flood prone areas located by the side of a perennial nala flowing adjacent to the site. The site needs proper development as regards drainage of sewage or complete treatment so as to have zero discharge.
3. The STP proposed does not have provision for separating grey and normal discharge water. The proposal includes use of STP sludge for gardening, which is not acceptable. So they were advised to consult a professional firm in this regard and present a fool proof plan in the next meeting for consideration.
4. The proponent has applied for water supplies to the PHED, which is under consideration. In absence of the required connection, they may clarify the source of water for use during construction and operational phases of the housing complex.
5. The meteorological parameters including the maximum rain intensity required for calculating the extent of rainwater harvest seem to be inappropriate. They should get secondary data from the IMD, Bhubaneswar and present afresh.
6. Similarly, the standby power supplies DG sets are not thought of properly as regards actual power requirement and chimney height etc.

The Committee felt that the proponent may submit the above required basic documents after which a fresh date will be decided and communicated to them for appraisal.

ITEM NO – 2

PROPOSAL OF KARLAKONA MINES (QUARTZ) OF M/S UTKAL MANUFACTURING & SERVICES LIMITED, FOR PRODUCTION OF 20,680 TPA OF QUARTZ OVER ML AREA : 15.378 HA. OF 20,680 TPA OF QUARTZ OVER ML AREA : 15.378 HA. AT KARLAKONA, DISTT – RAYAGADA,

The proposal is for production of **20,680 TPA of Quartz over ML Area : 15.378 ha.** The TOR for this project was prescribed on 18.07.2008 by the Expert Appraisal Committee of MoEF, Govt. of India. The lease area is 15.378 ha and the entire lease is non forest land. The Lessee of the ML area is M/s Utkal Manufacturing & Services Ltd. Initial allotment of ML area was over an area of 14.569 ha. by the Department of Steel & Mines, Govt. of Orissa vide their letter no. III(K) SM-7/99-2485/SM dated 08.03.2000 and was approved by IBM vide letter no. BBS/RGD/Qtz/MP-57, dated 09.08.2000. During survey and demarcation of the area, Directorate of Mines finalized the area as 15.378 ha. and accordingly revised allotment letter issued by their office letter no. 1136/Mines, dated 31.03.2001. The revised mining plan was approved by IBM, vide their letter no. BBS/RGD/Qtz/MP-57 dated 13.02.2002. The public hearing was conducted on 8.01.2010. No National Park/Sanctuary is located within 10 km of the mine lease area. Mine working will be opencast and semi-mechanized involving drilling and blasting. Water requirement for the project is estimated to be 5 m³/day. The source is river Nagavali. The mine working will not intersect groundwater table. Waste generation will be 1.0 lakh m³ during plan period. The mine has earmarked 4.78 ha as OB dump area. The mine has proposed garland drain, check dams and retaining wall to prevent wash out of loose material from dump area.

Based on the information, documents and clarifications provided and presentation made by the consultant Ms Arundhati Tej, Environmental Research And Services (I) Pvt. Ltd. Plot No. B-22, Sector-B, Industrial Estate, Chandaka , the SEAC recommends for grant of environmental *clearance* in favour of the project for a period of five years subject to the following stipulated conditions:

1. The applicant (Project proponent) will take necessary measures for prevention, control and mitigation of Air Pollution, Water Pollution, Noise Pollution and Land Pollution including solid waste management as mentioned by him in Form-1, Final EIA reports and Environment Management Plan (EMP) in compliance with the prescribed statutory norms and standards.
2. The applicant will take necessary steps for socio-economic development of the people of the area on need based assessment for providing employment, education, health care, drinking water and sanitation, road and communication facilities etc.
3. The applicant will comply to the points, concerns and issues raised by the people during public hearing on 8.1.10 in accordance with the commitments made by him thereon.
4. The applicant will take statutory clearance/approval/permissions from the concerned authorities in respect of his project as and when required.
5. The mine has proposed to spread OB over 4.75 ha which is limited to few dumps to minimize damage to the existing land environment.
6. The run off, washings and other effluents should be properly treated and to be recharged rather than allowing to flow from a height of ~80m to the nearby perennial Nagabali river.
7. All the air pollution monitoring stations are seen to be located in villages/settlements when at least 30% area is surrounded by forests. The mine may select some air quality monitoring stations near accessible forest area to assess the pollution load .
8. The RPM levels are hardly below 10-15% of SPM, which seem inappropriate and not determined properly. It means the area already has predominantly fine dust particles prior to their operation, which is quite unlikely in a green and serene environment. The background environmental data presented are wrong and need to be redone or clarification whether . The model might have predicted erroneous results due to feeding of erroneous basic data to it. Thus, there is an overpowering feeling that the data presented are incorrect.
9. For post environmental clearance monitoring, the applicant will submit half-yearly compliance report in respect of the stipulated terms and conditions of Environmental Clearance to the State Environmental Impact Assessment Authority (SEIAA), Orissa on 1st June and 1st December of each calendar year.
10. The core zone should be monitored intensively with no. of stations as prescribed by CPCB, Delhi and unit of pollutant level should be expressed as NAAQ of CPCB, Delhi. The detail methodology adopted for analysis of samples shall be clearly indicated.
11. The proponent shall submit ground tooting baseline data on flora & fauna and CSR activities already carried out within three months to the SEIAA

12. Adequate buffer zone shall be maintained between two consecutive mineral bearing deposits.
13. The following shall be implemented viz. (a) dump run-off should be diverted into settling ponds (b) adequate rain water harvesting and ground water recharging facilities should be developed in the core zone; (c) attempt should be made to achieve zero water balance.
14. Maintenance of roads through which transportation of ores are undertaken shall be carried out by the project proponent regularly at its own cost.
15. Fugitive dust generation shall be controlled. Fugitive dust emission shall be regularly monitored at locations of nearest human habitation (including schools and other public amenities located nearest to sources of dust generation as applicable) and records shall be submitted to the SEIAA, Orissa.
16. Transportation of ore shall be done by covering the trucks with tarpaulin or other suitable mechanism so that no spillage of ore / dust takes place.
17. Rain water harvesting shall be undertaken to recharge the ground water source.
18. Monitoring of ground and surface water quality shall be regularly conducted and records should be maintained and data shall be submitted regularly to the SEIAA, Orissa.
19. The proponent shall ensure that no silt originating due to mining activity is transported in the surface water course. Measures for prevention and control of soil erosion and management of silt shall be undertaken. Protection of dumps against erosion shall be carried out with geo textile matting or other suitable material, and thick plantations of native trees and shrubs shall be carried out at the dump slopes. Dumps shall be protected by retaining walls.
20. Trenches / garland drains shall be constructed at foot of dumps to arrest silt from being carried to water bodies. Adequate number of Check Dams shall be constructed across seasonal/perennial nallahs (if any) flowing through the ML area and silts be arrested. De- silting at regular intervals shall be carried out.
21. Provision shall be made for the housing of the labourers within the site with all necessary infrastructure and facilities such as fuel for cooking, mobile toilets, mobile STP, safe drinking water, medical health care, crèche etc. The housing may be in the form of temporary structures to be removed after the completion of the project.
22. Occupational health and safety measures for the workers including identification of work related health hazards, training on malaria eradication, HIV, and health effects on exposure to mineral dust etc. shall be carried out. The Proponent shall engage a full time qualified doctor who is trained in occupational health. Periodic monitoring for exposure to respirable mineral dust on the workers shall be conducted and records maintained including health records of the workers. Awareness programme for workers on impact of mining on their health and precautionary measures like use of personal equipments etc. shall be carried out periodically. Review of impact of various health measures undertaken (at interval of five years or less) shall be conducted followed by follow up action wherever required. Occupational Health Centre shall be established near the mine site itself.

23. Shelter belt i.e Wind Break of 15 m width and consisting of at least 5 tiers around lease facing the human habitation, school / agricultural fields etc. (if any in the vicinity), in the safety zone/ back-filled & reclaimed areas, around voids & roads shall be raised. Green belt development and selection of plant species shall be as per CPCB guidelines. Density of the trees has to be around 2500 plants per hectare. Herbs and shrubs shall also form a part of afforestation programme besides tree plantation. Help & guidance of local DFO may be sought in the matter. Details of year wise afforestation programme including rehabilitation of mined out area shall be submitted to the SEIAA, Orissa within six months.
24. The mining operations shall be restricted to above ground water table and it should not intersect the groundwater table.
25. The top soil shall temporarily be stored at earmarked site(s) only and it should not be kept unutilized for long (not more than 3 years). The topsoil shall be used for land reclamation and plantation.
26. The over burden (OB) generated during the mining operation shall be stacked at earmarked dump site(s) only and it should not be kept active for a long period of time and its phase-wise stabilization shall be carried out. Proper terracing of OB dump shall be carried out so that the overall slope shall not exceed 28^o. Backfilling shall be done as per approved mining plan. Back-filling to start from 3rd year onwards of the mining operation & the entire quantity of waste generated shall be backfilled & liquidated within five years. There shall be no external over-burden dumps after the 6th year of the mining operation. The backfilled area shall be afforested. Back-filling has to be done in a manner that it is restored to the normal ground level. Monitoring & management of rehabilitated areas should continue till the vegetation is established & becomes self-generating. Compliance status to be reported to the appropriate authorities.
27. The funds earmarked for the environment protection measures shall be judiciously utilized. Under no circumstances this funds shall be diverted for other purposes. Year-wise expenditure for this fund should be reported to the SEIAA, Orissa.
28. The critical parameters such as SPM, RSPM, NOX in the ambient air within the impact zone, peak particle velocity at 300m distance or within the nearest habitation, whichever is closer shall be monitored periodically. Further, quality of discharged water shall also be monitored [(TDS, DO, PH and Total Suspended Solids (TSS)]. The monitored data shall be uploaded on the website of the company as well as displayed on a display board at the project site at a suitable location near the main gate of the Company in public domain. The circular No. J-20012/1/2006-IA.II(M) dated 27.05.2009 issued by Ministry of Environment and Forests, which is available on the website of the Ministry www.envfor.nic.in shall also be referred in this regard for its compliance.
29. A Final Mine Closure Plan along with details of Corpus Fund shall be submitted to the SEIAA 5 years in advance of final mine closure for approval.
30. The project proponent shall obtain necessary prior permission of the competent authorities for drawl of requisite quantity of water (surface water and ground water) required for the project.

31. The above mentioned stipulated conditions shall be complied in time bound manner. Failure to comply with any of the conditions mentioned above may result in withdrawal of this environmental clearance and attract action under the provisions of Environment Protection (EP) Act, 1986.

ITEM NO -3

SHOPPING MALL & MULTIPLEX PROJECT OF SAFARI RETREATS AT RASULGARH CHOWK, CUTTACK, PURI ROAD, BHUBANESWAR

The proposal is a **shopping mall & multiplex project of safari retreats at rasulgarh Chowk, Cuttack, Puri Road, Bhubaneswar**. The developers have the required space (5.05 Ac) to put up the proposed multi-storied (Basement-1 & 2 + G1 & 2 +2 upper floors) 27m high commercial complex beside the busy intersection of NH5 and Cuttack-Puri road. It will have two underground parking lots with two floors of retail shops, a restaurant along with a multiplex on the uppermost floor. They expect around 18000 visitors daily. Total Plot Area is 220239,36 sq. ft . Total built up area is 949935 sq.ft . The total water requirement is 543 KLD. The water requirement will be met from ground water. The waste water will be generated which will be treated in a Sewage Treatment Plant (STP). Treated water will be re-used for DG cooling ,flushing, green belt and landscaping.. Total solid waste generation will be 2740 Kg/day. The power requirement is 4000 KVA . Total cost of the project is Rs.150 crores.. In absence of BDA plan approval the proposal should not have come up for discussion appraisal. Since the proposal was already forwarded by SEIAA and the proponents along with their consultant were already invited, the proposal was examined and presentation was made. However, notwithstanding further discussions and comments, the proposal lacked certain basic requirements of town planning and addressing environmental concerns as enumerated below.

1. The proposed commercial unit will be located in a busy intersection of two National Highways, one connecting Kolkata to Chennai and Cuttack/Bhubaneswar to Puri is uncalled for and lacks foresightedness. This will lead to traffic snares, which is already reeling under traffic jams during major part of the day and evenings. Further, there have been a number of fatal accidents in this area due to vehicular traffic and the roads disproportionate to traffic requirements. This would need clearance from the Town Planning Department of the Government in view of the above serious observation.
2. The water requirement is under estimated. The entire water requirement is proposed to be met from ground water sources, the proponent shall furnish necessary clearance from concerned authority.
3. The entire water requirement of 60,000L per day is proposed to be met through tankers for which no concrete supply source was identified. The question was to pump the entire tank loads of water to the overhead tanker and associated problems, which could not be adequately addressed.
4. Due to a number of multi-storied housing complexes and dwelling units in the area, the ground water is being drawn at a high rate. Consequently, the level has gone down. Further withdrawal by the project may cause severe depletion of ground water. The proponent should produce an estimate of the present withdrawals from ground water reserve of the area.

5. Solid wastes (2.5 tons per day) including e-waste disposal and sewage treatment system proposed were inadequate, which need further clarification. **They propose to recycle the ETP sludge, which is not as per environmental norms.**
6. The parking lot proposed in the underground floors for a few vehicles would be quite inadequate for ~18000 visitors a day. There is no detail on emissions from vehicles while driving in and out of the lots.
7. Details on the diesel generator sets (4MW) for supplying power during failures seem inadequate to meet the peak power requirements of the huge commercial complex including central AC. There are serious objections on their placement, emissions and dispersal into the free atmosphere through chimney. Safe storage of diesel in the premises are not spelt out.
8. The existing sound level in the region is already high due to traffic running almost round the clock. The proponent may monitor existing sound level and predict to what extent the proposal is likely to add to it.

In view of the above serious observations and objections, the proponent may be asked to clarify with adequate documents prior to their second and final appraisal to be fixed after going through the documents.

ITEM NO. 4

**PROPOSAL OF MULTISTORIED BUILDING AT OF GENPACT, DLF IT PARK
INFOCITY IT SPECIAL ECONOMIC ZONE (SEZ) CHANDAKA I/E, BHUBANESWAR**

The proponent could not attend the meeting. The committee decided to defer the case.

**(PROF. GAGAN BIHARI NITYANANDA CHAINY)
CHAIRMAN, SEAC**

**(PROF. SWOYAM PRAKASH ROUT)
MEMBER, SEAC**

**(PROF. KUMAR DAS)
MEMBER, SEAC**

**(DR. MOHESHWAR PATRA)
MEMBER, SEAC**

**(DR. HAREKRISHNA NAYAK)
MEMBER, SEAC**

**(PROF. R. C. MOHANTY)
MEMBER, SEAC**

**(DR. SURENDRA NATH DAS)
MEMBER, SEAC**

**(SRI S. DAS)
SECRETARY, SEAC**

**(S. S. PATTNAIK)
MEMBER, SEAC**

